

# MUNICIPAL EMPLOYEES' RETIREMENT SYSTEM OF MICHIGAN

ANNUAL ACTUARIAL VALUATION REPORT DECEMBER 31, 2013 MUSKEGON, CITY OF (6116)



Spring, 2014

Muskegon, City of

In care of: Municipal Employees' Retirement System of Michigan 1134 Municipal Way Lansing, Michigan 48917

This report presents the results of the Annual Actuarial Valuation, prepared as of December 31, 2013. The report includes the determination of liabilities and contribution rates resulting from the participation of Muskegon, City of (6116) in the Municipal Employees' Retirement System of Michigan ("MERS"). MERS is an independent public nonprofit organization that has partnered with Michigan municipalities for more than 65 years, helping them provide safe, secure retirement plans for their employees. Muskegon, City of is responsible for the employer contributions needed to provide MERS benefits for its employees and former employees under the Michigan Constitution and the MERS Plan Document.

The purpose of the December 31, 2013 annual actuarial valuation is to:

- · measure funding progress,
- establish contribution requirements for the fiscal year beginning July 1, 2015, and
- provide actuarial information in connection with applicable Governmental Accounting Standards Board statements.

This valuation report should not be relied upon for any other purpose. Reliance on information contained in this report by anyone for anything other than the intended purpose could be misleading.

The valuation uses financial data, plan provision data, and participant data as of December 31, 2013 furnished by MERS' administrative staff. In accordance with Actuarial Standards of Practice No. 23, the data was checked for internal and year to year consistency as well as general reasonableness, but was not otherwise audited. Tegrit Group does not assume responsibility for the accuracy or completeness of the data used in this valuation.

The actuarial assumptions and methods are adopted by the Retirement Board. Please refer to the division-specific assumptions described in table(s) in this report, and to the Appendix on the MERS website at:

www.mersofmich.com/Portals/0/Assets/Resources/AAV-Appendix/MERS-2013AnnualActuarialValuation-Appendix.pdf.

The actuarial assumptions used for this valuation produce results that we believe are reasonable.



To the best of our knowledge, this report is complete and accurate, was prepared in conformity with generally recognized actuarial principles and practices, with the Actuarial Standards of Practice issued by the Actuarial Standards Board, and is in compliance with Act No. 220 of the Public Acts of 1996, as amended, and the MERS Plan Document as revised. All of the undersigned are members of the American Academy of Actuaries (MAAA), and meet the Qualification Standards of the American Academy of Actuaries to render the actuarial opinion contained herein. The Retirement Board of the Municipal Employees' Retirement System of Michigan confirms that the System provides for payment of the required employer contribution as described in Section 20m of Act No. 314 of 1965 (MCL 38.1140m).

Our advice is purely actuarial in nature. It is not intended to serve as a substitute for legal, accounting or investment advice.

This report was prepared at the request of the Retirement Board and may be provided only in its entirety by the municipality to other interested parties (MERS customarily provides the full report on request to related third parties such as the auditor for the municipality). Tegrit Group is not responsible for the consequences of any unauthorized use.

You should notify MERS if you disagree with anything contained in the report or are aware of any information that would affect the results of the report that have not been communicated to us. If you have reason to believe that the plan provisions are incorrectly described, that important plan provisions relevant to this valuation are not described, that conditions have changed since the calculations were made, that the information provided in this report is inaccurate or is in anyway incomplete, or if you need further information in order to make an informed decision on the subject matter in this report, please contact MERS at: <a href="http://www.mersofmich.com/MERS/About-MERS/Contact-Us">http://www.mersofmich.com/MERS/About-MERS/Contact-Us</a>

Sincerely,

Alan Sonnanstine, MAAA, ASA Cathy Nagy, MAAA, FSA Jim Koss, MAAA, ASA Rebecca Stouffer, MAAA, ASA

# **TABLE OF CONTENTS**

	Page
Executive Summary	5
Employer Contribution Details Table 1	9
Benefit Provisions Table 2	11
Membership Summary Table 3	14
Reported Assets (Market Value) Table 4	16
Flow of Valuation Assets Table 5	17
Actuarial Accrued Liabilities and Valuation Assets  Table 6	18
Actuarial Accrued Liabilities - Comparative Schedule  Table 7	20
GASB 25 and GASB 27 Information	21
Benefit Provision History	23
Plan Provisions, Actuarial Assumptions, and Actuarial Funding Method	27

#### **Executive Summary**

#### **Funded Ratio and Required Employer Contributions**

The MERS Defined Benefit Plan is an agent multiple-employer plan, meaning that assets are pooled for investment purposes but separate trusts are maintained for each individual employer. Each municipality is responsible for their own plan liabilities; MERS does not borrow from one municipality's account to pay for another.

The funded ratio of a plan is the percentage of the dollar value of the accrued benefits that is covered by the actuarial value of assets.

#### Your Funded Ratio:

	12/31/2013	12/31/2012
Funded Ratio	91%	94%

Michigan Law requires that pension plans be pre-funded, meaning money is set aside now to pay for future benefits. Pension plans are usually funded by employer and employee contributions, and investment income.

As a result of the plan's funding policy, the funded ratio is expected to approach 100% over time. How quickly a plan attains the 100% goal depends on many factors such as:

- The current funded ratio,
- The future experience of the plan, and
- The amortization period.

It is more important to look at the trend in the funded ratio over a period of time than at a particular point in time.

#### **Your Required Employer Contributions:**

Your minimum required employer contributions are shown on the following page. Employee contributions, if any, are shown in Table 2, and are in addition to the required employer contribution on the next page.

	Percentage	e of Payroll	Monthly \$ Based o	on Valuation Payroll
Valuation Date:	12/31/2013	12/31/2012	12/31/2013	12/31/2012
Fiscal Year Beginning:	July 1, 2015	July 1, 2014	July 1, 2015	July 1, 2014
Division	,			
01 - NonUnion Gen	-	-	\$ 18,211	\$ 13,619
02 - NonUn Police	-	-	794	678
10 - General Ret	-	-	10,118	6,644
11 - Clerical	-	-	2,412	2,414
12 - DPW 517M	-	-	13,365	8,208
20 - PLC/Fire Ret	-	-	40,422	32,209
21 - PolicePatrol	-	-	18,058	15,309
22 - Police Comm	-	10.65%	9,825	9,116
50 - FF Local 370	-	-	16,884	18,349
Municipality Total			\$ 130,089	\$ 106,546

You may contribute more than the minimum required contributions, as these additional contributions will earn investment income, and later you may have to contribute less than otherwise. MERS strongly encourages employers to contribute more than the minimum contribution shown above.

Assuming that experience of the plan meets actuarial assumptions:

• To accelerate to a 100% funding ratio in 10 years, estimated monthly contributions for the entire employer would be \$ 149,636, instead of \$ 130,089.

If you are interested in making additional contributions, please contact MERS and they can assist you with evaluating your options.

#### **How and Why Do These Numbers Change?**

In a defined benefit plan contributions vary from one annual actuarial valuation to the next as a result of the following:

- Changes in benefit provisions (see Table 2),
- Changes in actuarial assumptions and methods (see the Appendix), and
- Experience of the plan (investment experience and demographic experience); this is the difference between actual experience of the plan and the actuarial assumptions.

Actuarial valuations do not affect the ultimate cost of the plan; the benefit payments (current and future) determine the cost of the plan. Actuarial valuations only affect the timing of the contributions into the plan. Because assumptions are for the long term, plan experience will not match the actuarial assumptions in any given year (except by coincidence). Each annual actuarial valuation will adjust the required employer contributions up or down based on the prior year's actual experience.

#### **Comments on the Investment Markets**

At this time, MERS maintains the 8% annual return assumption in the belief that over the long-term this is achievable. For example, MERS' 30 year return was 9.3% on December 31, 2013. The MERS portfolio returned 14.8% in 2013; the two year (12.9%), three year (9.2%), four year (10.4%), and five year (11.7%) returns all exceed the 8% annual return assumption. It has now been five years since the peak of the financial crisis and the stock market decline still weighs down MERS' medium term returns. This was a one in fifty year event comparable only to the Stock Market Crash of 1929 during the Great Depression. The stock market and economy have stabilized since 2008 and are on the long road to recovery. MERS regularly monitors the investment return assumption to make sure it is reasonable compared to long term expectations.

The actuarial value of assets, used to determine both your funded ratio and your required employer contribution, is based on a 10-year smoothed value of assets. Only a portion (six-tenths, for 2008 - 2013) of the 2008 investment market losses was recognized in this actuarial valuation report. This reduces the volatility of the valuation results, which affects your required employer contribution and funded ratio.

As of December 31, 2013 the actuarial value of assets is 106% of market value. This means that meeting the actuarial assumption in the next few years will require average annual market returns that exceed the 8% investment return assumption.

If the December 31, 2013 valuation results were based on market value on that date instead of 10-year smoothed funding value: i) the funded percent of your entire municipality would be 86% (instead of 91%); and ii) your total employer contribution requirement for the fiscal year starting July 1, 2015 would be \$ 2,132,496 (instead of \$ 1,561,068).

The asset smoothing method is a powerful tool for reducing the volatility of your required employer contributions. However, if the current 6% difference between the smoothed value and the market value of assets is not made up, the result would be gradual increases in your employer contribution requirement over the next few years (to around the levels described above).

#### Alternate Scenarios to Estimate the Potential Volatility of Results ("What If Scenarios")

The analysis in this section is intended to review the potential volatility of the actuarial valuation results. It is important to note that calculations in this report are mathematical estimates based upon assumptions regarding future events, which may or may not materialize. Actuarial calculations can and do vary from one valuation to the next, sometimes significantly depending on the group's size.

In the table below, we show the impact of varying one actuarial assumption: the future annual rate of investment return. Lower investment returns would result in higher required employer contributions, and vice-versa.

Other assumptions are also important in determining the required employer contributions.

#### For example:

- Smaller than projected pay increases would lower required employer contributions.
- Reductions in the number of active employees would lower required contribution dollars, but would usually increase the contribution rate expressed as a percentage of payroll.
- Retirements at earlier ages than projected would usually increase required employer contributions.
- More non-vested terminations of employment than projected would decrease required contributions.
- More disabilities or survivor (death) benefits than projected would increase required contributions.
- Longer lifetimes after retirement than projected would increase required employer contributions.

The relative impact of each investment return scenario below will vary from year to year, as the participant demographics change. The impact of each scenario should be analyzed for a given year, not from year to year. The results in the table are based on the December 31, 2013 valuation, and are for the municipality in total, not by division.

	Assumed Future Annual Smoothed Rate of Investment Return							
	Lower Future Annual Returns					Valuation ssumption	Hig	gher Returns
12/31/2013 Valuation Results		6%		7%		8%		9%
Accrued Liability	\$	122,903,149	\$	109,899,539	\$	98,938,366	\$	89,637,705
Valuation Assets	\$	90,199,697	\$	90,199,697	\$	90,199,697	\$	90,199,697
Unfunded Accrued Liability	\$	32,703,452	\$	19,699,842	\$	8,738,669	\$	(561,992)
Funded Ratio		73%		82%		91%		101%
Monthly Normal Cost	\$	120,772	\$	85,329	\$	58,640	\$	38,587
Monthly Amortization Payment	\$	254,229	\$	161,542	\$	71,449	\$	(26,154)
Total Employer Contribution <sup>1</sup>	\$	375,001	\$	246,871	\$	130,089	\$	36,799

<sup>1</sup> If assets exceed accrued liabilities for a division, the division's amortization payment is negative and is used to reduce the division's employer contribution requirement. If the overfunding credit is larger than the normal cost, the division's full credit is included in the municipality's amortization payment above but the division's total contribution requirement is zero. This can cause the displayed normal cost and amortization payment to not add up to the displayed total employer contribution.

# **Employer Contribution Details For the Fiscal Year Beginning July 1, 2015**

Table 1

	Amort.	Emp	Employer Contributions <sup>1</sup>						
Division	Period for Unfund. Liab. <sup>4,5</sup>	Normal Cos		Infunded Accrued Liability	ı	Total Required Employer Contribut.	Blended Employer Contribut. <sup>7</sup>	GASB ARC <sup>6</sup>	Member Contribut. Conversion Factor <sup>2</sup>
Percentage of Payroll									
01 - NonUnion Gen	13	-	-	-		-			
02 - NonUn Police	13	-	-	-		-			
10 - General Ret	13	-	-	-		-			
11 - Clerical	13	-	-	-		-			
12 - DPW 517M	13	-	-	-		-			
20 - PLC/Fire Ret	13	-	-	-		-			
21 - PolicePatrol	13	-	-	-		-			
22 - Police Comm	18	-	-	-		-			
50 - FF Local 370	13	-	-	-	İ	-			
Estimated Monthly									·
Contribution <sup>3</sup>									
01 - NonUnion Gen	13	\$ 6,593	\$ \$	11,618	\$	18,211			
02 - NonUn Police	13	C	)	794		794			
10 - General Ret	13	C	)	10,118		10,118			
11 - Clerical	13	2,592	2	(180)		2,412			
12 - DPW 517M	13	6,593	3	6,772		13,365			
20 - PLC/Fire Ret	13	C	)	40,422		40,422			
21 - PolicePatrol	13	22,915	5	(4,857)		18,058			
22 - Police Comm	18	6,705	5	3,120		9,825		122,976	
50 - FF Local 370	13	13,242	2	3,642		16,884			
Total Municipality		\$ 58,640	\$	71,449	\$	130,089			
Estimated Annual									
Contribution <sup>3</sup>		\$ 703,680	\$	857,388	\$	1,561,068			

<sup>1</sup> The above Employer contribution requirements are in addition to the Member contributions, if any, shown in Table 2.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> If Member contributions are increased/decreased by 1.00% of pay, the Employer contribution requirement will decrease/increase by the Member Contribution Conversion Factor.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> For divisions that are open to new hires, estimated contributions are based on valuation payroll. Actual contributions will be based on actual reported monthly pays, and will be different from the above amounts (usually higher). For divisions that will have no new hires, invoices will be based on the above dollar amounts which are based on projected fiscal year payroll. See description of Open Divisions and Closed Divisions in the Appendix.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> If projected assets exceed projected liabilities as of the beginning of the July 1, 2015 fiscal year, the negative unfunded accrued liability is amortized (spread) over 10 years. This amortization is used to reduce the employer contribution rate. Note that if the overfunding credit is larger than the normal cost, the full credit is shown above but the total contribution requirement is zero. This will cause the displayed normal cost and unfunded accrued liability contributions to not add across.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> If the division is closed to new hires, with new hires not covered by MERS Defined Benefit Plan or Hybrid Plan provisions, the amortization period will decrease as follows: Under Amortization Option A, the period will decrease by 2 years each valuation year, until a minimum 5-year amortization is attained. Under Amortization Option B, the period will decrease by 2 years each valuation year, until reaching 15 years. Thereafter, the period will reduce by 1 year each valuation year, until a minimum 5-year amortization is attained. This will result in amortization payments that increase faster than the usual 4.5% each year. If the division is closed to new hires, with new hires (and transfers) covered by MERS Defined Benefit Plan or Hybrid Plan provisions, the standard open division amortization period will apply.

Please see the Comments on the Investment Markets.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> For reporting and disclosure purposes under Statement Nos. 25 and 27 of the Governmental Accounting Standards Board, the annual required contribution (ARC) for this division is based on a 30 year level dollar amortization.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> For linked divisions, the employer will be invoiced the Total Required Employer Contribution rate shown above for each linked division (a contribution rate for the open division; a contribution dollar for the closed-but-linked division), unless the employer elects to contribute the Blended Employer Contribution rate shown above, by contacting MERS at 800-767-2308.

# **Benefit Provisions**

## Table 2

	2013 Valuation	2012 Valuation
Benefit Multiplier:	2.25% Multiplier (80% max)	2.25% Multiplier (80% max)
Normal Retirement Age:	60	60
Vesting:	5 years	5 years
Early Retirement (Unreduced):	55/25	55/25
Early Retirement (Reduced):	50/25	50/25
	55/15	55/15
Final Average Compensation:	3 years	3 years
Member Contributions:	5%	5%
RS50% Percentage:	50%	50%
D-2:	D-2 (25%)	D-2 (25%)
OC Plan for New Hires:	2/1/2006	2/1/2006
	Annuity Withdrawal (Valuation Interest Rate)	Annuity Withdrawal (Valuation Interest Rate)
Act 88:	Yes (Adopted 11/10/1964)	Yes (Adopted 11/10/1964)

02 -	NonUn	Police:	Closed	to	new	hires
<b>U</b> L -	14011011	i Olice.	Olosca	··	1104	111163

	2013 Valuation	2012 Valuation
Benefit Multiplier:	3.00% Multiplier (80% max)	3.00% Multiplier (80% max)
Normal Retirement Age:	55	55
Vesting:	10 years	10 years
Early Retirement (Unreduced):	53/25	53/25
Early Retirement (Reduced):	50/25	50/25
Final Average Compensation:	3 years	3 years
Member Contributions:	6%	6%
RS50% Percentage:	50%	50%
D-2:	D-2 (25%)	D-2 (25%)
DC Plan for New Hires:	2/1/2006	2/1/2006
	Annuity Withdrawal (Valuation Interest Rate)	Annuity Withdrawal (Valuation Interest Rate)
Act 88:	Yes (Adopted 11/10/1964)	Yes (Adopted 11/10/1964)

# 10 - General Ret: Closed to new hires

	2013 Valuation	2012 Valuation
Benefit Multiplier:	Old Plan Benefits	Old Plan Benefits
Normal Retirement Age:	-	-
Vesting:	-	-
Early Retirement (Unreduced):	-	-
Early Retirement (Reduced):	-	-
Final Average Compensation:	-	-
Member Contributions:	-	-
Act 88:	Yes (Adopted 11/10/1964)	Yes (Adopted 11/10/1964)

D-2 (25%)

11/1/2006

Yes (Adopted 11/10/1964)

# Table 2 (continued)

DC Plan for New Hires:

D-2:

Act 88:

11 - Clerical: Closed to new hires				
	2013 Valuation	2012 Valuation		
Benefit Multiplier:	2.25% Multiplier (80% max)	2.25% Multiplier (80% max)		
Normal Retirement Age:	60	60		
Vesting:	5 years	5 years		
Early Retirement (Unreduced):	55/30	55/30		
Early Retirement (Reduced):	50/25	50/25		
	55/15	55/15		
Final Average Compensation:	3 years	3 years		
Member Contributions:	5%	5%		
RS50% Percentage:	50%	50%		

#### 12 - DPW 517M: Closed to new hires

D-2 (25%)

11/1/2006

Yes (Adopted 11/10/1964)

	2013 Valuation	2012 Valuation
Benefit Multiplier:	2.25% Multiplier (80% max)	2.25% Multiplier (80% max)
Normal Retirement Age:	60	60
Vesting:	10 years	10 years
Early Retirement (Unreduced):	55/30	55/30
Early Retirement (Reduced):	50/25	50/25
	55/15	55/15
Final Average Compensation:	3 years	3 years
Member Contributions:	5%	5%
RS50% Percentage:	50%	50%
D-2:	D-2 (25%)	D-2 (25%)
DC Plan for New Hires:	5/1/2007	5/1/2007
Act 88:	Yes (Adopted 11/10/1964)	Yes (Adopted 11/10/1964)

#### 20 - PLC/Fire Ret: Closed to new hires

	2013 Valuation	2012 Valuation
Benefit Multiplier:	Old Plan Benefits	Old Plan Benefits
Normal Retirement Age:	-	-
Vesting:	-	-
Early Retirement (Unreduced):	-	-
Early Retirement (Reduced):	-	-
Final Average Compensation:	-	-
Member Contributions:	-	-
Act 88:	Yes (Adopted 11/10/1964)	Yes (Adopted 11/10/1964)

# Table 2 (continued)

21 - PolicePatrol: Closed to	new hires	
	2013 Valuation	2012 Valuation
Benefit Multiplier:	3.00% Multiplier (75% max)	3.00% Multiplier (75% max)
Normal Retirement Age:	55	55
Vesting:	10 years	10 years
Early Retirement (Unreduced):	50/25	50/25
Early Retirement (Reduced):	-	-
Final Average Compensation:	3 years	3 years
Member Contributions:	6%	6%
RS50% Percentage:	50%	50%
D-2:	D-2 (25%)	D-2 (25%)
DC Plan for New Hires:	8/1/2006	8/1/2006
	Annuity Withdrawal (Valuation Interest Rate)	Annuity Withdrawal (Valuation Interest Rate)
Act 88:	Yes (Adopted 11/10/1964)	Yes (Adopted 11/10/1964)

22 - Police Comm: Closed to	new hires	
	2013 Valuation	2012 Valuation
Benefit Multiplier:	3.00% Multiplier (75% max)	3.00% Multiplier (80% max)
Normal Retirement Age:	55	55
Vesting:	10 years	10 years
Early Retirement (Unreduced):	50/25	53/25
Early Retirement (Reduced):	-	50/25
Final Average Compensation:	3 years	3 years
Member Contributions:	6%	6%
RS50% Percentage:	50%	50%
D-2:	D-2 (25%)	D-2 (25%)
DC Plan for New Hires:	4/1/2013	
	Annuity Withdrawal (Valuation Interest Rate)	Annuity Withdrawal (Valuation Interest Rate)
Act 88:	Yes (Adopted 11/10/1964)	Yes (Adopted 11/10/1964)

50 - FF Local 370: Closed to	new hires	
	2013 Valuation	2012 Valuation
Benefit Multiplier:	2.75% Multiplier (85% max)	2.75% Multiplier (85% max)
Normal Retirement Age:	55	55
Vesting:	10 years	10 years
Early Retirement (Unreduced):	53/25	53/25
Early Retirement (Reduced):	50/25	50/25
Final Average Compensation:	3 years	3 years
Member Contributions:	6%	6%
RS50% Percentage:	50%	50%
D-2:	D-2 (25%)	D-2 (25%)
DC Plan for New Hires:	5/1/2007	5/1/2007
	Annuity Withdrawal (Valuation Interest Rate)	Annuity Withdrawal (Valuation Interest Rate)
Act 88:	Yes (Adopted 11/10/1964)	Yes (Adopted 11/10/1964)

# **Membership Summary**

Table 3

	2013	Va	luation	2012	2012 Valuation			2013 Valuation			
Division	Number		Annual Payroll <sup>1</sup>	Number		Annual Payroll <sup>1</sup>	Average Age	Average Benefit Service <sup>2</sup>	Average Eligibility Service <sup>2</sup>		
01 - NonUnion Gen	Itallibei		1 ayron	Number		1 dyron	Age	OCI VICC	OCIVICO		
Active Members	21	\$	1,431,491	27	\$	1,876,350	49.3	21.4	21.9		
Vested Former Members	4	Ψ	40,307	5	١٣	59,536	47.2	8.4	10.1		
Retirees and Beneficiaries	22		776,669	14		496,993	62.4	0.4	10.1		
02 - NonUn Police		_	770,000	'7	$\vdash$		02.4				
Active Members	0	\$	0	0	\$	0	0.0	0.0	0.0		
Vested Former Members	0	Ψ	0	0	١٣	0	0.0	0.0	0.0		
Retirees and Beneficiaries	2		36,018	2	ŀ	36,018	59.2	0.0	0.0		
10 - General Ret		_	30,010		$\vdash$	30,010	55.2				
Active Members	0	\$	0	0	\$	0	0.0	0.0	0.0		
Vested Former Members	8	Ψ	93,452	10	۱۳	126,146	53.4	3.0	12.0		
Retirees and Beneficiaries	113		1,282,534	120		1,302,531	76.5	5.0	12.0		
11 - Clerical	113		1,202,004	120	-	1,302,331	70.0				
Active Members	16	\$	569,642	18	\$	636,515	48.7	18.0	18.0		
Vested Former Members	2	Ψ	11,384	2	۱۳	12,312	31.9	7.8	7.8		
Retirees and Beneficiaries	5		69,462	4		55,574	59.4	7.0	7.0		
12 - DPW 517M	<del>-                                       </del>		00,402		┢	00,07 4	00.4				
Active Members	37	\$	1,582,863	42	\$	1,742,781	49.6	18.9	18.9		
Vested Former Members	5	*	73,038	5	Ť	73,038	53.8	14.4	15.8		
Retirees and Beneficiaries	22		570,962	16		412,435	61.7		10.0		
20 - PLC/Fire Ret			0.0,002		┢	,	• • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • •				
Active Members	0	\$	0	0	\$	0	0.0	0.0	0.0		
Vested Former Members	3		46,182	4	•	64,491	48.0	0.0	11.3		
Retirees and Beneficiaries	128		2,668,880	132		2,731,256	75.4	0.0			
21 - PolicePatrol			, ,		H	, - ,					
Active Members	46	\$	2,925,453	48	\$	2,955,348	41.8	15.2	15.2		
Vested Former Members	5		108,695	5		108,695	41.6	12.2	12.8		
Retirees and Beneficiaries	5		187,089	5		187,089	52.8				
22 - Police Comm			· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		T	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·					
Active Members	12	\$	859,926	14	\$	1,027,127	44.3	19.7	19.7		
Vested Former Members	1		41,150	1		41,150	51.4	20.8	20.8		
Retirees and Beneficiaries	6		304,961	4		212,139	57.6				
50 - FF Local 370			· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		T	, -					
Active Members	26	\$	1,829,563	27	\$	1,947,304	46.8	19.2	19.3		
Vested Former Members	2		68,491	2		68,491	48.8	17.4	20.8		
Retirees and Beneficiaries	9		440,862	8		369,649	57.3				

# Table 3 (continued)

	2013 Valuation		2012	2012 Valuation		2013 Valuation		
Division	Number	Annual Payroll <sup>1</sup>	Number	Annual Payroll <sup>1</sup>	Average Age	Average Benefit Service <sup>2</sup>	Average Eligibility Service <sup>2</sup>	
Total Municipality								
Active Members	158	\$ 9,198,938	176	\$ 10,185,425	46.3	18.2	18.3	
Vested Former Members	30	482,699	34	553,859	48.3	8.7	13.0	
Retirees and Beneficiaries	<u>312</u>	6,337,437	<u>305</u>	5,803,684	72.3			
Total Particpants	500		515					

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Annual payroll for active members; annual deferred benefits payable for vested former members; annual benefits being paid for retirees and beneficiaries.

 $<sup>^{2}</sup>$  Description can be found under Miscellaneous and Technical Assumptions in the  $\underline{\text{Appendix}}$ .

# **Reported Assets (Market Value)**

Table 4

	2013 Va	luation	2012 Va	luation
	Employer and		Employer and	
Division	Retiree <sup>1</sup>	Employee <sup>2</sup>	Retiree <sup>1</sup>	Employee <sup>2</sup>
01 - NonUnion Gen	\$ 10,908,091	\$ 1,414,686	\$ 9,213,579	\$ 1,914,169
02 - NonUn Police	293,706	0	282,721	0
10 - General Ret	8,885,145	259,404	8,822,056	322,603
11 - Clerical	1,984,104	496,376	1,701,585	482,587
12 - DPW 517M	9,297,917	1,627,027	7,839,907	1,906,091
20 - PLC/Fire Ret	16,256,578	116,165	16,344,621	173,397
21 - PolicePatrol	10,384,122	2,767,868	8,754,986	2,617,091
22 - Police Comm	6,153,970	990,260	5,056,019	1,135,494
50 - FF Local 370	11,090,629	2,020,551	9,378,209	2,056,043
Municipality Total	\$ 75,254,262	\$ 9,692,337	\$ 67,393,683	\$ 10,607,475
Combined Reserves	\$ 84,946,599 \$ 78,001,158			

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Reserve for Employer Contributions and Benefit Payments

The December 31, 2013 valuation assets are equal to 1.061840 times the reported market value of assets (compared to 1.143563 as of December 31, 2012). The derivation of valuation assets is described, and detailed calculations of valuation assets are shown, in the <u>Appendix</u>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Reserve for Employee Contributions

# **Flow of Valuation Assets**

Table 5

Year		Contrib	utions			Member		
12/31		Employer	Member	Investment Income	Benefit Payments	Contrib. Refunds	Net Transfers	Valuation Asset Balance
2006	\$	55,956,699	\$ 4,695,235	\$ 4,324,738	\$ (1,896,331)	\$ (9,077)	\$ 580,900	\$ 63,652,164
2007	İ	16,582,297	4,334,437	5,963,112	(4,694,268)	(72,528)	392,610	86,157,824
2008		1,166,958	731,864	3,642,050	(4,879,568)	(16,639)	125,743	86,928,232
2009		860,608	732,249	3,215,403	(5,024,244)	(105,036)	74,389	86,681,601
2010		2,215,151	662,958	4,468,557	(5,066,044)	(209,631)	57,762	88,810,354
2011		1,183,329	642,901	4,207,086	(5,311,426)	(140,832)	109,227	89,500,639
2012		1,091,561	587,649	3,728,234	(5,734,235)	(45,520)	70,910	89,199,238
2013		1,545,925	552,706	5,013,341	(6,007,642)	(256,400)	152,529	90,199,697

Note: Transfers in and out are usually related to the transfer of participants between municipalities, and to employer and member payments for service credit purchases (if any) that the governing body has approved.

# Actuarial Accrued Liabilities and Valuation Assets As of December 31, 2013

Table 6

Division		arial Accrued Liability		ation Assets <sup>1</sup>	Percent Funded	(0	Jnfunded verfunded) Accrued Liabilities
01 - NonUnion Gen		Liability	Value	ation Assets	1 Crociit i dilaca		Liabilities
Active Members	\$	5,877,416	\$	4,488,566	76.4%	\$	1,388,850
Vested Former Members	Ι Ψ	240,468	•	240,468	100.0%	Ψ	1,300,030
Retirees And Beneficiaries		8,355,784		8,355,784	100.0%		0
Pending Refunds		0,333,764 <u>0</u>		0,555,764	0.0%		<u>0</u>
Total	\$	14,473,668	\$	13,084,818	90.4%	\$	1,388,850
02 - NonUn Police		14,410,000		10,001,010	301476		1,000,000
Active Members	\$	0	\$	0	0.0%	\$	0
Vested Former Members	'	0		0	0.0%	*	0
Retirees And Beneficiaries		410,352		311,869	76.0%		98,483
Pending Refunds		<u>0</u>		<u>0</u>	0.0%		0
Total	\$	410,352	\$	311,869	76.0%	\$	98,483
10 - General Ret				·			<u> </u>
Active Members	\$	0	\$	0	0.0%	\$	0
Vested Former Members		634,641		226,727	35.7%		407,914
Retirees And Beneficiaries		10,242,911		9,450,644	92.3%		792,267
Pending Refunds	İ	32,677		<u>32,677</u>	100.0%		<u>0</u>
Total	\$	10,910,229	\$	9,710,048	89.0%	\$	1,200,181
11 - Clerical							
Active Members	\$	1,919,665	\$	1,940,698	101.1%	\$	(21,033)
Vested Former Members	İ	22,760		22,760	100.0%		0
Retirees And Beneficiaries		670,415		670,415	100.0%		0
Pending Refunds		<u>0</u>		<u>0</u>	0.0%		<u>0</u>
Total	\$	2,612,840	\$	2,633,873	100.8%	\$	(21,033)
12 - DPW 517M							
Active Members	\$	5,652,870	\$	4,879,751	86.3%	\$	773,119
Vested Former Members		505,545		505,545	100.0%		0
Retirees And Beneficiaries		6,195,655		6,195,655	100.0%		0
Pending Refunds		<u>19,592</u>		<u>19,592</u>	100.0%		<u>0</u>
Total	\$	12,373,662	\$	11,600,543	93.8%	\$	773,119
20 - PLC/Fire Ret							
Active Members	\$	0	\$	0	0.0%	\$	0
Vested Former Members		198,932		116,165	58.4%		82,767
Retirees And Beneficiaries		22,137,810		17,269,068	78.0%		4,868,742
Pending Refunds		<u>0</u>		<u>0</u>	0.0%		<u>0</u>
Total	\$	22,336,742	\$	17,385,233	77.8%	\$	4,951,509

Table 6 (continued)

	Actu	arial Accrued				(0	Jnfunded verfunded) Accrued
Division		Liability	Valu	ation Assets <sup>1</sup>	Percent Funded	L	-iabilities
21 - PolicePatrol							
Active Members	\$	10,591,013	\$	11,157,994	105.4%	\$	(566,981)
Vested Former Members		596,355		596,355	100.0%		0
Retirees And Beneficiaries		2,128,773		2,128,773	100.0%		0
Pending Refunds		<u>82,187</u>		<u>82,187</u>	100.0%		<u>0</u>
Total	\$	13,398,328	\$	13,965,309	104.2%	\$	(566,981)
22 - Police Comm							
Active Members	\$	4,157,200	\$	3,676,228	88.4%	\$	480,972
Vested Former Members		356,147		356,147	100.0%		0
Retirees And Beneficiaries		3,553,654		3,553,654	100.0%		0
Pending Refunds		<u>0</u>		<u>0</u>	0.0%		<u>0</u>
Total	\$	8,067,001	\$	7,586,029	94.0%	\$	480,972
50 - FF Local 370							
Active Members	\$	8,684,415	\$	8,250,846	95.0%	\$	433,569
Vested Former Members		622,127		622,127	100.0%		0
Retirees And Beneficiaries		5,049,002		5,049,002	100.0%		0
Pending Refunds		<u>0</u>		<u>0</u>	0.0%		<u>0</u>
Total	\$	14,355,544	\$	13,921,975	97.0%	\$	433,569
Total Municipality							
Active Members	\$	36,882,579	\$	34,394,083	93.3%	\$	2,488,496
Vested Former Members		3,176,975		2,686,294	84.6%		490,681
Retirees and Beneficiaries		58,744,356		52,984,864	90.2%		5,759,492
Pending Refunds		<u>134,456</u>		<u>134,456</u>	100.0%		<u>0</u>
Total Participants	\$	98,938,366	\$	90,199,697	91.2%	\$	8,738,669

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Includes both employer and member assets.

#### Please see the Comments on the Investment Markets.

See the MERS Fiscal Responsibility Policy on the MERS website at:

http://www.mersofmich.com/Portals/0/Assets/PageResources/MERS/PlanDocument/Pension/sec 43c.pdf.

# **Actuarial Accrued Liabilities - Comparative Schedule**

Table 7

Valuation Date December 31	Actuarial Accrued Liability	Valuation Assets	Percent Funded	Unfunded (Overfunded) Accrued Liabilities	UAL as Percent of Annual Payroll
2006	\$ 63,537,463	\$ 63,652,164	100%	\$ (114,701)	
2007	83,118,204	86,157,824	104%	(3,039,620)	
2008	86,794,286	86,928,232	100%	(133,946)	
2009	87,394,951	86,681,601	99%	713,350	6%
2010	88,391,392	88,810,354	100%	(418,962)	
2011	92,614,337	89,500,639	97%	3,113,698	29%
2012	95,219,730	89,199,238	94%	6,020,492	59%
2013	98,938,366	90,199,697	91%	8,738,669	95%

Notes: Actuarial assumptions were revised for the 2000, 2004, 2008, 2009, 2010, 2011, and 2012 actuarial valuations.

#### GASB 25 and GASB 27 Information

The following information has been prepared to provide the information necessary to comply with GASB Statements Number 25 and 27. Statement 25 is effective for fiscal years beginning after June 15, 1996 and Statement 27 is effective for fiscal years beginning after June 15, 1997.

All entries and the annual employer contribution amount were based on the actuarial methods and assumptions used in the December 31, 2013 actuarial valuation. The entry age normal actuarial method was used to determine the disclosure entries.

#### **GASB 25 Information (as of 12/31/2013)**

Actuarial Accrued Liability	
Retirees and beneficiaries currently receiving benefits	\$ 58,744,356
Terminated employees (vested former members) not yet receiving benefits	3,176,975
Non-Vested terminated employees (pending refunds of accumulated member contributions)	134,456
Current employees -	
Accumulated employee contributions including allocated investment income	8,532,908
Employer financed	<u>28,349,671</u>
Total Actuarial Accrued Liability	\$ 98,938,366
Net Assets Available for Benefits at Actuarial Value	\$ 90,199,697
(Market Value is 84,946,599)	
Unfunded (Overfunded) Actuarial Accrued Liability	\$ 8,738,669
GASB 27 Information (as of 12/31/2013)	
Fiscal Year Beginning	July 1, 2015
Annual Required Contribution (ARC)	\$ 1,566,144 <sup>1</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Based on valuation payroll (based on projected fiscal year payroll for divisions that will have no new hires). For divisions that are open to new hires the actual required contribution will be based on current monthly payroll (during the fiscal year beginning July 1, 2015) times the computed employer contribution rate(s) shown in Table 1. The ARC shown here is the sum of the ARC's calculated separately for each division.

# GASB 27 Information (Used in the 12/31/2013 Annual Actuarial Valuation)

# Amortization Factors Used to Compute Employer Contribution Requirements Used for Funding Calculations and Most ARC Calculations (see below) (Payments Increase 4.5% per Year)

Amortization Factor Used - Underfunded or Overfunded Liabilities (5 years)	0.221706
Amortization Factor Used - Underfunded or Overfunded Liabilities (6 years)	0.187731
Amortization Factor Used - Underfunded or Overfunded Liabilities (7 years)	0.163488
Amortization Factor Used - Underfunded or Overfunded Liabilities (8 years)	0.145330
Amortization Factor Used - Underfunded or Overfunded Liabilities (9 years)	0.131227
Amortization Factor Used - Underfunded or Overfunded Liabilities (10 years)	0.119963
Amortization Factor Used - Underfunded or Overfunded Liabilities (11 years)	0.110763
Amortization Factor Used - Underfunded or Overfunded Liabilities (12 years)	0.103112
Amortization Factor Used - Underfunded or Overfunded Liabilities (13 years)	0.096652
Amortization Factor Used - Underfunded or Overfunded Liabilities (14 years)	0.091128
Amortization Factor Used - Underfunded or Overfunded Liabilities (15 years)	0.086353
Amortization Factor Used - Underfunded or Overfunded Liabilities (16 years)	0.082185
Amortization Factor Used - Underfunded or Overfunded Liabilities (17 years)	0.078519
Amortization Factor Used - Underfunded or Overfunded Liabilities (18 years)	0.075270
Amortization Factor Used - Underfunded or Overfunded Liabilities (19 years)	0.072372
Amortization Factor Used - Underfunded or Overfunded Liabilities (20 years)	0.069773
Amortization Factor Used - Underfunded or Overfunded Liabilities (21 years)	0.067430
Amortization Factor Used - Underfunded or Overfunded Liabilities (22 years)	0.065308
Amortization Factor Used - Underfunded or Overfunded Liabilities (23 years)	0.063378
Amortization Factor Used - Underfunded or Overfunded Liabilities (24 years)	0.061616
Amortization Factor Used - Underfunded or Overfunded Liabilities (25 years)	0.060002

# Amortization Factor Used to Compute the GASB Annual Required Contribution (ARC) For Divisions that are Closed to New Hires

(and new hires are not covered by MERS DB or Hybrid provisions in a linked division) If Division is Less than 100% Funded, and Uses a Funding Period over 15 Years

Amortization Factor Used - Underfunded Liabilities (30 year level \$) 0.085453

Assumptions: Continuous Payments; Interest at 8% Per Year

# **Benefit Provision History**

The following benefit provision history is provided by MERS. Any corrections to this history or discrepancies between this information and information displayed elsewhere in the valuation report should be reported to MERS. All provisions are listed by date of adoption.

#### 01 - NonUnion Gen

1/1/2012	Non Standard Compensation Definition
7/1/2010	Fiscal Month - July
3/1/2006	Blanket Resolution (All Service)
2/1/2006	DC Adoption Date 02-01-2006
1/1/2006	Benefit RS 50 (50% Post-Ret. Spouse Benefits)
1/1/2006	Annuity Withdrawal - MERS Rate
1/1/2006	Benefit FAC-3 (3 Year Final Average Compensation)
1/1/2006	Benefit D2 Plan
1/1/2006	5 Year Vesting
1/1/2006	Benefit B-3 (80% max)
1/1/2006	Day of work defined as 150 Hours a Month for all employees
1/1/2006	Member Contribution Rate 5.00%
1/1/2006	Benefit F55 (With 25 Years of Service)
1/1/2006	Exclude Temporary Employees
11/10/1964	Covered by Act 88

#### 02 - NonUn Police

8/1/2011	3.0% Multiplier (80% max)
8/1/2011	Benefit F55 (With 10 Years of Service)
7/1/2010	Fiscal Month - July
3/1/2006	Blanket Resolution (All Service)
2/1/2006	DC Adoption Date 02-01-2006
1/1/2006	Benefit RS 50 (50% Post-Ret. Spouse Benefits)
1/1/2006	Exclude Temporary Employees
1/1/2006	Annuity Withdrawal - MERS Rate
1/1/2006	DB Exempt from Social Security
1/1/2006	Benefit FAC-3 (3 Year Final Average Compensation)
1/1/2006	10 Year Vesting
1/1/2006	Benefit D2 Plan
1/1/2006	2.75% Multiplier (80% max)
1/1/2006	Day of work defined as 150 Hours a Month for all employees
1/1/2006	Member Contribution Rate 6.00%
1/1/2006	Eligible at Age 53 (With 25 Years of Service)
11/10/1964	Covered by Act 88

#### 10 - General Ret

7/1/2010	Fiscal Month - July
1/1/2009	Flexible E .5% COLA Adopted (01/01/2009)
1/1/2009	E Cola Adoption Date 01-01-2009
1/1/2009	E Cola Increase Amount .5

#### 10 - General Ret 1/1/2009 E Cola Increase Type Percent Flexible E .9% COLA Adopted (01/01/2008) 1/1/2008 8/1/2007 Flexible E .9% COLA Adopted (08/01/2007) 8/1/2006 Benefit FAC-3 (3 Year Final Average Compensation) 8/1/2006 **Exclude Temporary Employees** 5 Year Vesting 8/1/2006 8/1/2006 Benefit B-3 (80% max) Blanket Resolution (Generic Service) 3/1/2006 11/10/1964 Covered by Act 88 11 - Clerical 1/1/2012 Non Standard Compensation Definition 7/1/2010 Fiscal Month - July 11/1/2006 DC Adoption Date 11-01-2006 10/1/2006 5 Year Vesting 10/1/2006 Blanket Resolution (All Service) 10/1/2006 Benefit FAC-3 (3 Year Final Average Compensation) Benefit RS 50 (50% Post-Ret. Spouse Benefits) 10/1/2006 10/1/2006 Benefit D2 Plan **Exclude Temporary Employees** 10/1/2006 10/1/2006 Benefit B-3 (80% max) 10/1/2006 Day of work defined as 150 Hours a Month for all employees Member Contribution Rate 5.00% 10/1/2006 10/1/2006 Benefit F55 (With 30 Years of Service) 11/10/1964 Covered by Act 88 12 - DPW 517M 1/1/2012 Non Standard Compensation Definition 7/1/2010 Fiscal Month - July 5/1/2007 DC Adoption Date 05-01-2007 **Exclude Temporary Employees** 5/1/2007 4/1/2007 Benefit D2 Plan 4/1/2007 Benefit RS 50 (50% Post-Ret. Spouse Benefits) 4/1/2007 10 Year Vesting 4/1/2007 Benefit FAC-3 (3 Year Final Average Compensation) 4/1/2007 Benefit B-3 (80% max) Day of work defined as 150 Hours a Month for all employees 4/1/2007 4/1/2007 Member Contribution Rate 5.00% 4/1/2007 Benefit F55 (With 30 Years of Service) 3/1/2006 Blanket Resolution (Generic Service) 11/10/1964 Covered by Act 88

#### 20 - PLC/Fire Ret

7/1/2010 Fiscal Month - July

1/1/2009 Flexible E .5% COLA Adopted (01/01/2009)

## 20 - PLC/Fire Ret

1/1/2009	E Cola Adoption Date 01-01-2009
1/1/2009	E Cola Increase Amount .5
1/1/2009	E Cola Increase Type Percent
1/1/2008	Flexible E .9% COLA Adopted (01/01/2008)
8/1/2007	Flexible E .9% COLA Adopted (08/01/2007)
8/1/2006	Benefit FAC-3 (3 Year Final Average Compensation)
8/1/2006	Annuity Withdrawal - MERS Rate
8/1/2006	10 Year Vesting
8/1/2006	Exclude Temporary Employees
8/1/2006	2.75% Multiplier (80% max)
8/1/2006	Benefit F55 (With 10 Years of Service)
3/1/2006	Blanket Resolution (Generic Service)
11/10/1964	Covered by Act 88

## 21 - PolicePatrol

7/1/2010	Fiscal Month - July
1/1/2009	3.0% Multiplier (75% max)
1/1/2009	Benefit F50 (With 25 Years of Service)
1/1/2007	2.75% Multiplier (75% max)
8/1/2006	DC Adoption Date 08-01-2006
7/1/2006	Benefit FAC-3 (3 Year Final Average Compensation)
7/1/2006	Exclude Temporary Employees
7/1/2006	Benefit D2 Plan
7/1/2006	Benefit RS 50 (50% Post-Ret. Spouse Benefits)
7/1/2006	DB Exempt from Social Security
7/1/2006	Annuity Withdrawal - MERS Rate
7/1/2006	10 Year Vesting
7/1/2006	Benefit B-4 (75% max)
7/1/2006	Day of work defined as 150 Hours a Month for all employees
7/1/2006	Member Contribution Rate 6.00%
7/1/2006	Benefit F55 (With 10 Years of Service)
7/1/2006	Eligible at Age 51 (With 25 Years of Service)
3/1/2006	Blanket Resolution (Generic Service)
11/10/1964	Covered by Act 88

# 22 - Police Comm

4/1/2013	DC Adoption Date 04-01-2013
1/1/2013	Non Standard Compensation Definition
1/1/2013	3.0% Multiplier (75% max)
1/1/2013	Benefit F50 (With 25 Years of Service)
7/1/2010	Fiscal Month - July
1/1/2007	3.0% Multiplier (80% max)
7/1/2006	Benefit FAC-3 (3 Year Final Average Compensation)
7/1/2006	Exclude Temporary Employees
7/1/2006	Benefit D2 Plan

# 22 - Police Comm

7/1/2006	Benefit RS 50 (50% Post-Ret. Spouse Benefits)
7/1/2006	DB Exempt from Social Security
7/1/2006	Annuity Withdrawal - MERS Rate
7/1/2006	10 Year Vesting
7/1/2006	Benefit B-4 (80% max)
7/1/2006	Day of work defined as 150 Hours a Month for all employees
7/1/2006	Member Contribution Rate 6.00%
7/1/2006	Benefit F55 (With 10 Years of Service)
7/1/2006	Eligible at Age 53 (With 25 Years of Service)
3/1/2006	Blanket Resolution (Generic Service)
11/10/1964	Covered by Act 88

# 50 - FF Local 370

7/1/2010	Fiscal Month - July
5/1/2007	Exclude Temporary Employees
5/1/2007	DC Adoption Date 05-01-2007
4/1/2007	Benefit D2 Plan
4/1/2007	Benefit RS 50 (50% Post-Ret. Spouse Benefits)
4/1/2007	10 Year Vesting
4/1/2007	Annuity Withdrawal - MERS Rate
4/1/2007	Benefit FAC-3 (3 Year Final Average Compensation)
4/1/2007	2.75% Multiplier (85% max)
4/1/2007	Day of work defined as 150 Hours a Month for all employees
4/1/2007	Member Contribution Rate 6.00%
4/1/2007	Eligible at Age 53 (With 25 Years of Service)
4/1/2007	Benefit F55 (With 10 Years of Service)
3/1/2006	Blanket Resolution (Generic Service)
11/10/1964	Covered by Act 88

# Plan Provisions, Actuarial Assumptions, and Actuarial Funding Method

Details on MERS plan provisions, actuarial assumptions, and actuarial methodology can be found in the <u>Appendix</u>. Some actuarial assumptions are specific to this municipality and its divisions. These are listed below.

#### **Increase in Final Average Compensation**

Division	FAC Increase Assumption
All Divisions	1.00%

## **Withdrawal Rate Scaling Factor**

Division	Withdrawal Rate Scaling Factor
All Divisions	100%

# **Miscellaneous and Technical Assumptions**

Loads - None.

# **Amortization Policy for Closed Divisions**

Closed Division	Amortization Option	
All Closed Divisions	Option A	